

The Formula “Non-A is A” in Vasubandhu’s commentary on the *Triśatikāyāḥ* *Prajñāpāramitāyāḥ Kārikāsaptatiḥ*

Choong, Yoke-Meei*

Abstract

The well-known formula in the *Vajracchedikā*: “That A taught by the Tathāgata, it is taught as non-A by the Tathāgata, thus it is called A by the Tathāgata” (hereafter abbreviated as “non-A is A”) takes over the role of emptiness, and initiated debates among some Japanese scholars about its connotation and application. One of the topics of discussion is whether the “non-A is A” formula expresses emptiness in the ontological sense of the Madhyamaka, or whether it illustrates a graduated path to be performed by the Bodhisattva. These two views do not commensurate with each other, because, for them, the Madhyamaka non-A, that is emptiness, stands for the inexpressible highest truth, while in the graduated path non-A is a negation of what is falsely imagined by ordinary people. These scholars have not consulted the Yogācāra views on this formula. There is besides a verse summary of the *Vajracchedikā* composed by Asaṅga called the *Triśatikāyāḥ Prajñāpāramitāyāḥ Kārikāsaptatiḥ* also a commentary written by Vasubandhu. The verse summary is comprehensible only by referring to Vasubandhu’s commentary, which is extant in only two

Chinese translations. These Yogācāra's works provide several ways of interpretation of the formula "non-A is A". In them both views of the Japanese debate, whether "non-A is A" expresses the highest truth or whether it illustrates a graduated path to be performed by the bodhisattva, are integrated together.

Keywords: Non-A is A, *Triśatikāyāḥ Prajñāpāramitāyāḥ Kārikāsaptatiḥ*, Bodhiruci, Yijing, *Vajracchedikā*

《金剛般若論頌》中「非 A 即 A」句型初探

宗玉嫻*

摘要

東西學者已注意到《金剛般若經》中沒有出現「空」，相反地「佛說是 A，非是 A，故說是 A」（以下簡稱為「非 A 是 A」）的句型出現頻繁，代替了「空」的地位。日本學者對《金剛般若經》中「非 A 是 A」的句型有不同的詮釋。其中的爭論是此句型是在表達本體論的空性，或是一種菩薩漸次趨向佛的境界的實踐過程。他們的爭論的起因主要是單從中觀的立場來詮釋此句型。因為根據中觀「非 A」是勝義，但在菩薩的漸次道上「非 A」是遮遣錯誤觀念的 A。他們都沒有參考《金剛般若經》的印度釋論，因此忽略了在世親的釋論，也即是唯識的詮釋中，表達本體論的空性與菩薩的漸次實踐道並非互不相容的。

中國與西藏將《金剛般若波羅蜜多經論頌》（漢譯《能斷金剛般若波羅蜜多經論頌》，義淨（635-713 C.E.）譯。藏譯收入《北京版西藏大藏經》，冊 146，No. 5864。《德格板西藏大藏經》並無收藏此經。）視為無著針對《能斷金剛般若波羅蜜多經》要義所作的頌文。根據梵文寫本的後記，此頌的梵文名叫 *Triśatikāyāḥ Prajñāpāramitāyāḥ Kārikāsaptatiḥ*，共有 77 頌。已由 Tucci 所校勘。此頌文簡潔，必須參考世親的注釋，才能理解。世親的注釋有菩提流支所譯《金剛般若波羅蜜經論》（《大正新修大藏經》冊 25，經號 1511）。在此譯本菩提流支也譯出無著

* 作者係佛光大學佛教學院助理教授。

的頌文。同樣世親的注釋還有義淨所譯《能斷金剛般若波羅蜜多經論釋》（《大正大藏經》，冊 25，經號 1513）。在頌文的校勘中，Tucci 比對菩提流支和義淨的翻譯，並譯成英文。由於 Tucci 對無著頌文的翻譯偏重於義淨的譯本，所以有再重譯的必要。本文翻出此頌與「非 A 是 A」句型有關的偈頌，並參考世親對這些句型的注釋。

關鍵字：非 A 即 A、能斷金剛般若波羅蜜多經論頌、菩提流支、義淨、金剛般若經